Good governance and evaluation of Veterinary Services

Regional Seminar for OIE National Focal Points on Communication

25-27 March 2013, Beijing, China

Dr Tomoko Ishibashi
Acting Regional Representative for Asia and the Pacific
OIE MANDATE

Historical: ‘To prevent animal diseases from spreading around the world’

The 4th Strategic Plan 2006/2010 extends the OIE’s global mandate to:

‘The improvement of animal health all around the world’
OIE OBJECTIVES

ANIMAL HEALTH INFORMATION

to ensure transparency in the global animal disease and zoonosis situation

to collect, analyse and disseminate scientific veterinary information

WAHIS/WAHID

Scientific publications
OIE OBJECTIVES

INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

to promulgate health standards for the safety of international trade in animals and animal products (within its WTO mandate) and animal disease surveillance

to contribute to food safety and food security and to promote animal welfare, through a science-based approach
OIE OBJECTIVES

ACTIVITIES OF VETERINARY SERVICES

- to provide expertise and encourage international solidarity in the control of animal diseases
- to improve governance and the legal framework and resources of national Veterinary Services
Good Governance of Veterinary Services
Context - Impact of animal diseases

✓ Food Security: strong link with Public Health
✓ Public Health: zoonoses, food safety
✓ Market Access: local, regional and international
✓ Poverty Alleviation
  • Securing assets (animal capital)
  • Increasing productivity and food production
  • National and households economies
✓ Political and social stability
✓ Environment
Context

The emergence and re-emergence of animal diseases have potentially serious impacts in terms of public health, food security and poverty.

We need to reconsider our animal and public health policies and preparedness.

The public and private components of Veterinary Services are in the front line regarding these matters in all countries of the world.
Veterinary services
Are in the front line to implement OIE objectives

- poverty alleviation
- food security
- market access
- food safety
- protecting animal health
- protecting public health
- protecting animal welfare

global public good
GLOBAL PUBLIC GOOD CONCEPT

Global public goods are goods whose benefits extend to all countries, people and generations.

- In the case of control and eradication of infectious diseases, the benefits are international and inter-generational in scope
- Countries depend on each other
- Inadequate action by a single country can jeopardize others
- Failure of one country may endanger the planet
The CONCEPT of GOOD GOVERNANCE of VETERINARY SERVICES

Requirements for all countries

Need for appropriate and its implementation through national animal health legislation systems providing for:

- Appropriate surveillance, early detection
- Rapid response to animal disease outbreaks thanks to:
  - national chain of command
  - good diagnostic capacities
  - compensation
- Biosecurity
- Vaccination when appropriate
The CONCEPT of GOOD GOVERNANCE of VETERINARY SERVICES

Key elements:

- Appropriate legislation and its effective implementation
- Adequate financial and human resources
- Building and maintaining efficient epidemiosurveillance networks throughout the entire national territory
- Alliances between public and private sectors
- Comply with standards of ‘Quality of Veterinary Services’ adopted by all OIE Members
  - If needed, use of initial and follow up OIE PVS evaluations, PVS gap analysis, VLSP
- Initial and continuous training
- Veterinary education and applied research
- National chain of command

A responsibility of Governments
OIE capacity-building initiatives

• Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Pathway)
• Capacity-building programme for OIE National Focal Points and new Delegates
• Activities of OIE Reference Laboratories and Collaborating Centres
• Laboratory twinning programme
• Veterinary education
The OIE collaborates with governments, donors and other stakeholders.
The OIE collaborates with governments, donors and other stakeholders.
PVS evaluation of Veterinary Services

The diagnosis
OIE International Standards

Official reference of the World Trade Organisation SPS Agreement
Adopted by consensus of OIE Members

Terrestrial Animal Health Code
mammals, birds and bees
http://www.oie.int/eng/normes/mcode/en_sommaire.htm

Section 3: Quality of Veterinary Services
- Chapter 3.1. - Veterinary Services
- Chapter 3.2. - Evaluation of Veterinary Services
Quality of Veterinary Services depends on set of factors, including **fundamental principles** of an ethical, organisational and technical nature.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Nature</th>
<th>Organizational/technical Nature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional judgment</td>
<td>General organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>Quality policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impartiality</td>
<td>Procedures and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>Information, complaints and appeals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectivity</td>
<td>Documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Human / financial resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Quality of Veterinary Services can be measured through an evaluation**
Evaluation of Veterinary Services

- **Objective**: the evaluation should demonstrate that the ‘*Veterinary Services have the capability for effective control of the sanitary and zoosanitary status of animals and animal products*’

- **Key elements to be covered**:
  - Adequacy of resources
  - Management capability
  - **Legislative** and administrative infrastructures
  - Independence in the exercise of official functions
  - History of performance, including *disease* reporting
In applying Ch. 3.2 in an evaluation

Evaluation of the Performance of Veterinary Services

- a tool for Good Governance of Veterinary Services

*Initial Objective (in 2006): 105 Countries*

This global tool provided by the OIE has a great impact on the promotion and improvement of Veterinary Services worldwide.

http://www.oie.int/eng/oie/organisation/A_2010_PVSToolexcludingindicators.pdf
The OIE PVS Tool

4 fundamental components

Human, Physical & Financial Resources
- Critical competency
- Critical competency
- Critical Competency
- Critical competency

Technical Authority Capability
- Critical competency
- Critical competency
- Critical competency

Interaction with Stakeholders
- Critical competency
- Critical competency

Access to markets
- Critical competency

Critical competencies (6 - 13)

5 levels of advancement
OIE PVS Tool: Levels of Advancement

- 5 levels of advancement (qualitative) for each critical competency
- A higher level assumes compliance with all preceding levels
The OIE PVS tool – Example of CC

CHAPTER III - INTERACTION WITH STAKEHOLDERS

The capability of the VS to collaborate with and involve stakeholders in the implementation of programmes and activities.

**Critical competencies:**

- **Section III-1** Communications
- **Section III-2** Consultation with stakeholders
- **Section III-3** Official representation
- **Section III-4** Accreditation / authorisation / delegation
- **Section III-5** Veterinary Statutory Body
- **Section III-6** Participation of producers and other stakeholders in joint programmes

---

**Terrestrial Code References:**

Points 6, 7, 9 and 13 of Article 3.1.2. on Fundamental principles of quality: Veterinary legislation / General organisation / Procedures and standards / Communication.

Point 9 of Article 3.2.1. on General considerations.

Points 2 and 7 of Article 3.2.3. on Evaluation criteria for the organisational structure of the Veterinary Services.

Sub-point b) of Point 2 of Article 3.2.6. on Administrative resources: Communications.

Article 3.2.11. on Participation on OIE activities.

Article 3.2.12. on Evaluation of the veterinary statutory body.

Points 4, 7 and Sub-point g) of Point 9 of Article 3.2.14. on Administration details / Animal health and veterinary public health controls / Sources of independent scientific expertise.
The OIE PVS tool – Example of CC

III-1 Communications

The capability of the VS to keep stakeholders informed, in a transparent, effective and timely manner, of VS activities and programmes, and of developments in animal health and food safety.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of advancement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The VS have no mechanism in place to inform stakeholders of VS activities and programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The VS have informal communication mechanisms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The VS maintain an official contact point for communications but it is not always up-to-date in providing information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The VS contact point for communications provides up-to-date information, accessible via the Internet and other appropriate channels, on activities and programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The VS have a well developed communication plan, and actively and regularly circulate information to stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Country PVS Reports

- Country PVS reports are either:
  - **Confidential** (very few);
  - Available for transmission to Donors and Partners (72 reports to date);
  - In the **public domain** (18 to date): Belize, Bolivia, Botswana, Brazil, Central African Republic, Chile, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau; Haiti, Israel, Namibia, Nigeria, Panama; Paraguay; Swaziland, Syria, Uruguay and Vietnam.

http://www.oie.int/eng/oie/organisation/en_oie_pvs_eval_reports.htm?e1d2
# OIE PVS Evaluation Missions

## State of play (up to 15 October 2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OIE Members</th>
<th>PVS Evaluation requests received</th>
<th>PVS Evaluation missions implemented</th>
<th>Reports available for (restricted) distribution to Donors and Partners</th>
<th>Publication on the OIE website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia, the Far East and Oceania</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>178</strong></td>
<td><strong>119</strong></td>
<td><strong>111</strong></td>
<td><strong>82</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overview of PVS Evaluation missions
Examples of global diagnostic of PVS

- Chain of command from CVO not clear/strong
- Weakness of private sector organisations
- No compensation mechanisms
- Limited ability to control livestock movements
- Constraints to implement biosecurity measures
- Difficulty of implementing appropriate vaccination
- Failures in the control of veterinary drugs
The OIE collaborates with governments, donors and other stakeholders.

- PVS Gap Analysis
- PVS Evaluation
- Veterinary Education
- Public / Private Partnerships
- Veterinary Legislation
- Laboratories
- PVS Pathway Follow-Up Missions

« Diagnosis »
« Prescription »
« Treatment »

Capacity Building, Specific Activities, Projects and Programs

including Veterinary Services’ Strategic Priorities

PVS Gap Analysis

The prescription
PVS Gap Analysis

- To determine and confirm **country priorities** (country involvement)
- To define the **expected result** (level of advancement defined in the OIE PVS tool) at the end of the five-year period for the priority critical competencies
- To identify specific **activities, tasks and resources** (human, physical and financial) required to address “gaps” identified through the country PVS evaluation
- **Estimation of costs** (collaboration with Partners and Donors)
- Preparation of an **estimated budget**
- Support to preparation of **investment programmes**
PVS Gap Analysis Tool

Outputs
- Total Budget
- Analysis of the Budget

Inputs
- Unit Costs

Cost Estimation Cards
- Trade: 8 cards
- Animal Health: 5 cards
- Veterinary Public Health: 4 cards
- Veterinary Laboratories: 2 cards
- Management and Regulatory Services: 21 cards

CCIII-1 Communication
Using the PVS Gap Analysis

- **How and what to finance** is a sovereign decision of the country.

- The Country’s Government decides if this is kept for **internal** use or distributed if necessary to **Donors and relevant International Organisations** to prepare investment programmes.
Using the PVS Gap Analysis

- **In country discussions** with the relevant Minister, other Ministries, Ministry of Finance, Prime Minister, Head of State, National Parliament, depending on the context of the country

- **Round tables**, in the country, with Donor Agencies and International Organisations, incl. FAO

- Preparation of the country **Veterinary Services estimated Budget** for national or international investments
# PVS Gap Analysis Missions

## State of play (up to 15 October 2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>OIE Members</th>
<th>PVS Gap Analysis requests received</th>
<th>PVS Gap Analysis missions implemented</th>
<th>PVS Gap Analysis missions reports received</th>
<th>Reports available for (restricted) distribution to Donors and Partners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia, the Far East and Oceania</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>178</strong></td>
<td><strong>77</strong></td>
<td><strong>62</strong></td>
<td><strong>60</strong></td>
<td><strong>36</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overview of PVS Gap Analysis missions
PVS Pathway

The treatment
The OIE collaborates with governments, donors and other stakeholders.
Veterinary Legislation Identification Missions
State of play (up to 15 December 2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OIE Members</th>
<th>PVS Legislation mission requests received</th>
<th>PVS Legislation missions implemented</th>
<th>PVS Legislation documents received</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia, the Far East and Oceania</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overview of Veterinary legislation
Identification missions

Mission requested
Mission completed
PVS Pathway missions

- Veterinary legislation support programme;
- OIE PVS Evaluation of Aquatic Animal Health Services;
- Veterinary Education – Twinning;
- Veterinary Statutory Body – Twinning;
- Laboratory PVS Gap Analysis;
- One Health PVS mission;
- Round tables with donors / Strategic plan.
OIE capacity-building initiatives

“The treatment”

- Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Pathway)
- Capacity-building programme for OIE National Focal Points and new Delegates
- Activities of OIE Reference Laboratories and Collaborating Centres
- Laboratory twinning programme
- Veterinary education
Capacity-building programme for OIE Focal Points and new Delegates

“The treatment”

Regional training and updating seminars

Objectives

• Make better use of the specialist knowledge of focal points to support OIE Delegates in exercising their rights and discharging their responsibilities

• Improve participation in the process for setting OIE international standards and guidelines

• Transmission of animal health information

• Fields of expertise: aquatic animals, wildlife, animal disease notification to the OIE, veterinary products, communication, animal welfare, animal production food safety, laboratories (pilot)
Capacity-building programme for OIE Focal Points and new Delegates

In collaboration with the OIE Regional and Sub-Regional Representations

93 seminars organised up to 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Seminars</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia &amp; Pacific</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

23 seminars planned for 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Seminars</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia &amp; Pacific</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Target: One seminar every two years per focal point/region
OIE capacity-building initiatives

“The treatment”

- Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Pathway)
- Capacity-building programme for OIE National Focal Points and new Delegates
- Activities of OIE Reference Laboratories and Collaborating Centres
- Laboratory twinning programme
- Veterinary education
OIE Reference Laboratories

Centres of expertise in animal diseases

- Develop, conduct and validate diagnostic tests
- Store and distribute reference reagents
- Organise inter-laboratory proficiency testing
- Coordinate technical and scientific studies
- Provide technical and scientific training
236 Reference Laboratories with 176 experts covering 111 diseases or topics in 37 countries

May 2012
OIE Collaborating Centres

Centres of excellence on cross-cutting issues

- Help to develop procedures for updating and promoting international standards and guidelines on animal health and welfare
- Coordinate scientific studies
- Organise training workshops
- Organise and host technical meetings in collaboration with the OIE
World distribution of the OIE-Collaborating Centres

41 Collaborating Centres covering 38 topics in 22 countries

May 2012
OIE capacity-building initiatives

“The treatment”

- Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Pathway)
- Capacity-building programme for OIE National Focal Points and new Delegates
- Activities of OIE Reference Laboratories and Collaborating Centres
- Laboratory twinning programme
- Veterinary education
Laboratory twinning programme

- Meets the need to build scientific and technological expertise in developing and transition countries.

- By forging links between an OIE Reference Laboratory (principal) and a national laboratory (candidate) to enable the candidate laboratory to:
  - become self-sufficient in the early detection and diagnosis of diseases;
  - provide the scientific justification for animal health certification and measures for international trade;
  - contribute to the setting of standards and to debate these standards from a scientific standpoint.
OIE capacity-building initiatives

• Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services (OIE PVS Pathway)
• Capacity-building programme for OIE National Focal Points and new Delegates
• Activities of OIE Reference Laboratories and Collaborating Centres
• Laboratory twinning programme
• Veterinary education
Veterinary education

Initial & continuing veterinary education is essential for global good governance.

However,

The quality and content of veterinary education are not appropriate in up to 80% of the veterinary education establishments (VEEs) in the world.
Veterinary education

Global conferences on Veterinary Education

Need for:

• curriculum harmonisation
• day 1 minimum competencies
• quality control and accreditation procedures
• greater involvement of the Veterinary Statutory Body
• Prepare recommendations for pilot projects between VEEs and VSBs

OIE Global Conference on Veterinary Education and the Role of the Veterinary Statutory Body
4-6 December – Foz do Iguazu (Brazil)
The aim of OIE PVS Pathway is to support Member Countries in their efforts to ensure that their Veterinary Services comply with international standards.
Thank you for your attention

Organisation mondiale
de la santé animale

World Organisation
for Animal Health

Organización Mundial
de Sanidad Animal